The dynamics of the primordial follicle reserve

Jeffrey B Kerr^{1,2}, Michelle Myers^{1,2} and Richard A Anderson³

¹Department of Anatomy and Developmental Biology, School of Biomedical Sciences, Monash University, Clayton, Victoria 3800, Australia, ²Prince Henry's Institute of Medical Research, PO Box 5152, Clayton, Victoria 3168, Australia and ³Queens Medical Research Institute, MRC Centre for Reproductive Health, University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, UK

Correspondence should be addressed to J B Kerr at Department of Anatomy and Developmental Biology, School of Biomedical Sciences, Monash University; Email: jeff.kerr@monash.edu

Abstract

The female germline comprises a reserve population of primordial (non-growing) follicles containing diplotene oocytes arrested in the first meiotic prophase. By convention, the reserve is established when all individual oocytes are enclosed by granulosa cells. This commonly occurs prior to or around birth, according to species. Histologically, the 'reserve' is the number of primordial follicles in the ovary at any given age and is ultimately depleted by degeneration and progression through folliculogenesis until exhausted. How and when the reserve reaches its peak number of follicles is determined by ovarian morphogenesis and germ cell dynamics involving i) oogonial proliferation and entry into meiosis producing an oversupply of oocytes and ii) large-scale germ cell death resulting in markedly reduced numbers surviving as the primordial follicle reserve. Our understanding of the processes maintaining the reserve comes primarily from genetically engineered mouse models, experimental activation or destruction of oocytes, and quantitative histological analysis. As the source of ovulated oocytes in postnatal life, the primordial follicle reserve requires regulation of i) its survival or maintenance, ii) suppression of development (dormancy), and iii) activation for growth and entry into folliculogenesis. The mechanisms influencing these alternate and complex inter-related phenomena remain to be fully elucidated. Drawing upon direct and indirect evidence, we discuss the controversial concept of postnatal oogenesis. This posits a rare population of oogonial stem cells that contribute new oocytes to partially compensate for the age-related decline in the primordial follicle reserve.

Reproduction (2013) **146** R205–R215

Introduction

The concept of a non-renewable primordial follicle pool, assembled around the time of birth in rodents and during gestation in humans, underpins a finite reproductive life span and is central to current understanding of ovarian biology. Consideration of the dynamics of the primordial follicle reserve raises more questions than there are answers; however, although key pathways are emerging, their overall regulation and integration are poorly understood. The main concepts include i) how the reserve is established, ii) processes causing elimination, iii) regulation of follicle–oocyte dormancy or activation into a growth phase, and iv) possibility of renewal accompanying the age-dependent decline. The significance of the dynamics of the reserve is no more apparent than during ovarian morphogenesis and germ cell development in prenatal life in humans, and perinatally in the mouse and rat. In these growth periods, germ cells are produced in large numbers but many are subsequently eliminated, the outcome of which establishes the traditionally defined primordial reserve. Mechanisms

must exist to ensure that the majority of follicles are held intact and remain poised to participate in follicle growth, which in the human is preserved for decades. The reserve faces yet other challenges to its survival from exogenous agents that pose a risk of damage to the oocyte genome with accompanying DNA mutations, or more subtle epigenetic changes. How healthy or faulty oocytes within the reserve are recognized and respectively either preserved or destroyed is a key element impacting the dynamics of the primordial follicles. A reassessment of 'topping up' the reserve by the addition of new primordial follicles from ovarian germline stem cells (GSC) has emerged in the past 10 years. Although this concept has generated a lively debate and a resolution is far from complete, it introduces another factor that potentially affects the dynamics of the reserve. In summary, from the events that shape the establishment of the reserve in prenatal or neonatal ovaries up to the point of its functional exhaustion in adult life, we revisit the concepts of primordial follicle dynamics in the light of recent evidence influencing its stability, depletion, or supplementation.

Establishing the primordial follicle reserve

The human fetal ovary

The developing fetal ovary supports the proliferation and maturation of germ cells and their development into primordial follicles. Studies by Block (1951, 1952, 1953) of fetal, neonatal, and adult human ovaries ($n=53$) using quantitative histological methods provided the first credible estimates of the number of primordial follicles. At 7–9 months of gestation ($n=10$), he reported a range of 350 000 to 1.1 million primordial follicles/pair of ovaries, the average being about 700 000. In postnatal life from 6 to 9 years ($n=5$), the average was 500 000 declining to 8000 between 40 and 44 years ($n=7$; Block 1952). The age-related fall in follicle supply was not discussed in Block's studies. Within a decade, this oversight was corrected when in 1963 a landmark paper by Baker estimated the numbers of all germ cell types (normal and atretic) in human fetal ovaries ($n=14$). He calculated up to 6.8 million germ cells/pair of ovaries at 5 months of gestation declining to about 2 million at the time of birth. The scale of germ cell loss was comparable to the germ cell attrition reported for the rat ovary (Holmes & Mandl 1962, Beaumont & Mandl 1963), suggesting common regulatory mechanisms governing the perinatal supply of primordial follicles. Recent analyses using more accurate stereological methods have expanded on the rate and extent of germ cell proliferation up to 19 weeks of gestation (Mamsen *et al.* 2011), reaching nearly 5 million germ cells/ovary at that time, although no distinction is made between stages of development of the germ cells and the extent of inclusion within primordial follicles. Primordial follicles are formed from about 15 weeks of gestation in the human fetal ovary (Fig. 1) based on the association of diplotene oocytes with pregranulosa cells (Baker 1963, Forabosco & Sforza 2007). Their number steadily rises during the second trimester and plateaus in the third trimester with ~350 000–400 000/ovary at birth. From

about 22 weeks, some primordial follicles activate to form the first growing or primary follicles (Maheshwari & Fowler 2008). As far as we know, the second-trimester period of human fetal ovarian development is the only phase in the history of the dynamics of the reserve where it is increasing in overall number by the addition of oocytes surviving to reach diplotene arrest of meiosis I.

Little is known about the factors responsible for producing this excess of germ cells in the fetal ovary. Array-based studies have described the transcriptome in human fetal ovaries (Fowler *et al.* 2009), potentially allowing identification of regulatory pathways. A network of interacting oocyte transcription factors crucial for oocyte survival and development around the time of follicle formation has been described in the mouse using knockout models (Dong *et al.* 1996, Rajkovic *et al.* 2004, Pangas *et al.* 2006), with some, such as FIGLA, demonstrated to have comparable expression in the human ovary (Huntriss *et al.* 2002, Bayne *et al.* 2004). Limited functional studies of human fetal ovaries have identified activin A (Martins da Silva *et al.* 2004, Coutts *et al.* 2008, Childs & Anderson 2009) and neurotrophin pathways (Anderson *et al.* 2002, Spears *et al.* 2003, Childs *et al.* 2010a) as likely key determinants of oogonial survival and proliferation and follicle formation (Fig. 2). Activin β A is expressed by germ cells in nests and *in vitro* exposure to activin A promotes germ cell survival (Martins da Silva *et al.* 2004). Activin β A expression is lost immediately prior to nest breakdown and follicle formation (Coutts *et al.* 2008), and it is thought that this might act as a switch allowing follicle formation involving the de-repression of kit ligand expression (Childs & Anderson 2009). In the mouse, activin A administration *in utero* increased primordial follicle number after birth, although this difference was lost later in life (Bristol-Gould *et al.* 2006a). The BMPs have been suggested to positively regulate oogonial proliferation and survival in the mouse (Pesce *et al.* 2002), but by contrast, experimental human data suggest

Figure 1 Estimates of germ cell populations of the human fetal ovary based on histomorphometric analysis reported by Baker (1963) and Forabosco & Sforza (2007). Germ cells are always dying, the numbers of atretic germ cells (which include all oogonia and oocytes) being equal to or exceeding the numbers of individual diplotene oocytes or those forming primordial follicles. Primordial follicles begin to form at 15 weeks of gestation, and at birth, the fetal ovary on an average contains ~400 000 primordial follicles. This represents only 12% of the total germ cell number (healthy and atretic, see Baker (1963)) present at 22 weeks of gestation.

Figure 2 Human ovarian development and primordial follicle formation. Illustrative immunohistochemical images to demonstrate (A) proliferative oogonia (mitotic cells identified by arrows) and oocytes (Oo) within germ cell nests with intermixed NT4-expressing (brown) pregranulosa cells, with the somatic cells (sc) of the stromal regions not expressing NT4 at 13 weeks of gestation. (B) NT4 expression (brown) is also confined to pregranulosa cells within oocyte (Oo) nests and the granulosa cells of newly formed primordial follicles, with no expression in stromal cells (sc) at 21 weeks of gestation. (C) Activin β A is expressed by some nests of oocytes (Oo; green; red nuclear counterstain) but with much weaker expression in others (arrow), indicating synchronous development of oocytes within a nest at 19 weeks of gestation. (D) Schematic representation of experimentally derived interactions between growth factors expressed by oogonia/oocytes of the human fetal ovary and the adjacent pregranulosa cells. Stimulatory (+) and inhibitory (–) regulation as indicated. Scale bar (A, B and C), 20 μ m.

that BMP4 increases germ cell apoptosis (Childs *et al.* 2010b), possibly explained by differences in experimental methodology (i.e. isolated germ cells in the mouse vs in their physiological niche in human whole ovary studies).

The neurotrophins BDNF and NT4 are expressed by ovarian somatic cells within the cell nests (i.e. presumed precursors to granulosa cells; Fig. 2) with both ligands expressed in humans but only NT4 in mice. Mouse knockout models of the TrkB receptor, targeted by both BDNF and NT4, have resulted in phenotypes including loss of oocytes at the time of follicle formation (Spears *et al.* 2003) and loss of initiation of follicle growth (Paredes *et al.* 2004). Oocyte-derived activin β A regulates BDNF expression in human ovarian somatic cells and NT4 expression in mouse (Childs *et al.* 2010a), exemplifying a pathway by which the oocyte regulates the surrounding somatic environment and also demonstrating a conserved pathway between species, although involving diverse mediators. Prostaglandin E_2 acting on oocytes may also contribute to the regulation of expression of activin β A and BDNF (Bayne *et al.* 2009), and there are undoubtedly other pathways involved. These interactions, derived from experimental human tissue studies, are illustrated in Fig. 2.

More is known about the circumstances of oocyte death. We use the term ‘circumstances’ because of the limited opportunities available for analysis of human material (and no prospects for *in vivo*

experimentation), with most of our knowledge derived from the mouse. Although there are numerous descriptions of specific germ cell types and the timing of their demise in the human fetal ovary that impact on the dynamics of the reserve, the mechanisms responsible remain largely unknown (Maheshwari & Fowler 2008, Hartshorne *et al.* 2009). Much attention has focused on apoptosis (Vaskivuo *et al.* 2001, Fulton *et al.* 2005, Poljicanin *et al.* 2012), although emerging evidence also suggests that the mode of germ cell elimination, especially in meiosis, may be ovary specific and occurs by several mechanisms not limited to the classical apoptotic pathways (Abir *et al.* 2002). Efforts to identify and quantitate the characteristics of apoptosis as a principal or coherent explanation for oocyte depletion in the human fetal ovary often demonstrate the difficulties and inconsistencies in interpretation of cause and effect, probably due to differential gene expression among cell populations that may be at rest, proliferating, maturing, dying, or phagocytosing (Kurilo 1981, De Pol *et al.* 1997, Vaskivuo *et al.* 2001, Abir *et al.* 2002, Hartley *et al.* 2002, Fulton *et al.* 2005, Stoop *et al.* 2005, Albamonte *et al.* 2008, Jaaskelainen *et al.* 2010, Boumela *et al.* 2011, Poljicanin *et al.* 2012). Nevertheless, these and other studies demonstrate that the *Bcl2* gene family is an important regulator (among other factors) of the balance between survival or death of oocytes prior to primordial follicle formation.

The embryonic and neonatal mouse ovary

Germ cells of the embryonic mouse ovary follow a similar pattern of development as in the human except that it is only after birth that oocytes are fully assembled into the primordial follicle reserve, usually within 2–3 days (Fig. 3). In common with the human fetal ovary, there is a significant oversupply of oocytes entering meiosis prior to birth, which is markedly reduced in the perinatal period of development (Fig. 4; Peters *et al.* 1978, McClellan *et al.* 2003, Kerr *et al.* 2006, Pepling 2006, Pepling *et al.* 2010). With the advantage of experimental interventions such as the ability to modify

gene expression, much of our knowledge regarding female germ cell death mechanisms has been generated in the mouse.

Because primordial follicle formation is associated with significant germ cell attrition (Kezele *et al.* 2002, Pepling 2006), investigations into the associated death mechanisms have been topical and numerous laboratories, using both *in vivo* and *in vitro* techniques, have concluded that apoptosis (Coucouvanis *et al.* 1993, De Pol *et al.* 1997, Pepling & Spradling 2001, De Felici *et al.* 2008, Xu *et al.* 2011), autophagy (Lobascio *et al.* 2007, De Felici *et al.* 2008, Rodrigues *et al.* 2009), and direct extrusion from the ovaries (Rodrigues *et al.* 2009) are contributory mechanisms of pre- and neonatal oocyte demise. Apoptosis, the most favored of the three, has been demonstrated not only in mouse models directly targeting *Bcl2* and caspase genes (Bergeron *et al.* 1998, Perez *et al.* 1999, Rucker *et al.* 2000, Flaws *et al.* 2001, 2006, Alton & Taketo 2007, Ghafari *et al.* 2007, 2009, Greenfeld *et al.* 2007, Gursoy *et al.* 2008) but also because of the findings from several gene knockout (or overexpressor) models belonging to the tumor necrosis factor pathway (Marcinkiewicz *et al.* 2002, Greenfeld *et al.* 2007), PAR family (Wen *et al.* 2009), and TGF β family (Kimura *et al.* 2011), all of which actively participate in oocyte loss by regulating apoptosis.

What controls oocyte death to establish the reserve?

For oogonia and oocytes, the mechanism of cell death implemented may be related to the signal to die. Most studies of oocyte dynamics in the neonatal mouse ovary point to apoptosis as the mode of death (Ghafari *et al.* 2009, Boumela *et al.* 2011, Hu *et al.* 2011). Therefore, the primordial follicle reserve is presumably established by a balance between the availability of a large number of germ cells and subsequent programmed cell death. Why so many oocytes are produced only to be eliminated remains a mystery, but some possibilities are i) failure of mitosis/meiosis involving defective chromosome spindle functions, ii) unrepaired DNA damage, iii) insufficient pregranulosa cells, and iv) degeneration of oocytes during restructuring of oocyte cysts or nests into primordial follicles. The first clues that one member of the p53 gene network had a significant role in controlling oocyte fate came from studies showing that p63, specifically the TAp63 α isoform, is expressed uniquely in mouse oocytes and is responsible for their elimination if, for example, their DNA is damaged (Suh *et al.* 2006). Thus, p63 has a role in regulating oocyte survival to establish the primordial follicle reserve. Its expression in late prophase I oocytes but not in early meiotic oocytes or oogonia in fetal ovaries (both mouse and human) suggests a universal role for p63 in protection of the female germline represented by the primordial reserve (Livera *et al.* 2008). In the early postnatal mouse ovary, p63 controls oocyte supply by transcriptional induction of

Figure 3 Development of oocytes and primordial follicles. (A) Pachytene oocytes in e17 mouse ovary showing their arrangement into nests in which individual oocytes are not enclosed by somatic cells that will later become pregranulosa cells of primordial follicles. Scale bar, 15 μ m. (B) Postnatal day 1 mouse ovary showing oocyte nests in the cortex region to the right and larger individual primordial follicles (pf) in the medulla. Pyknotic structures (example at arrowhead) represent degenerative oocytes. Scale bar, 20 μ m.

Figure 4 Schematic diagram illustrating the general trends of endowment of oocytes and primordial follicles based on stereological analysis in the BL/6 mouse ovary over indicated ages. Dashed line, not based on data but an estimation of germ cell increase; solid line, mostly based on published data. Oocyte number increases markedly toward the end of fetal life but many are lost as they assemble to form primordial follicles in the first days after birth. For up to 2 weeks, postnatal primordial follicles decline significantly and then enter a period of very slow follicle loss for up to several months followed again by renewed depletion until near or total exhaustion around 12 months of age. Data based in part on Myers *et al.* (2004), Kerr *et al.* (2006, 2012a), Rodrigues *et al.* (2009), and Lei & Spradling (2013).

BH3-only proteins PUMA or PUMA and NOXA in combination (Kerr *et al.* 2012b). These pro-apoptotic Bcl2 members can initiate oocyte apoptosis either by direct or by indirect activation of BAX and BAK. Deletion of *Puma* or *Puma* and *Noxa* together results in an oversupply of primordial follicles in postnatal day 10 mouse ovaries, and deletion of other BH3-only genes, *Bmf* or *Bim* (*Bcl2l11*), also amplifies the reserve with up to triple the numbers of oocytes compared with age-matched controls (Fig. 5). The role, if any, of the other BH3-only proteins remains unknown. Given that 'overstocking' of the primordial reserve in the mouse ovary is wholly or partly the net result of a balance between pro- and anti-apoptotic events, it remains to be shown at what time and which germ cell types (i.e. oogonia and/or oocytes) are affected.

While these studies confirm that apoptotic regulatory mechanisms are key factors in altering the dynamics of the primordial reserve, they do not exclude the possibility of alternate or complementary processes for adjusting the oocyte population. Other studies of the developing human or mouse ovary have demonstrated that the apoptotic paradigm does not satisfactorily account for all aspects of germ cell death (Vaskivuo *et al.* 2001, Abir *et al.* 2002, Alton & Taketo 2007, De Felici *et al.* 2008, Rodrigues *et al.* 2009, Gawriluk *et al.* 2011). Alternative modes of cell death that may participate in oogonial-oocyte elimination include autophagy (Guillon-Munos *et al.* 2006, Rubinstein & Kimchi 2012), mitotic arrest (Wartenberg *et al.* 2001), or necroptosis (Christofferson & Yuan 2010, Vandenabeele *et al.* 2010).

Dynamics of the postnatal primordial follicle reserve and consequences for reproductive life span

Analogous to a stockpile of a precious resource, most oocytes of the primordial reserve are retained as quiescent follicles to support future ovulations throughout the reproductive life span. A poorly stocked initial reserve or one in which primordial follicles are precociously depleted will result in infertility and in

the human, a shortened reproductive life span and early menopause (Nelson *et al.* 2013). Current concepts involve progressive loss of human female fertility expressed through subfertility, sterility, and the menopause at ~10-year intervals (Broekmans *et al.* 2009). Thus, menopause at the age 40 years (the traditional definition of the upper limit of 'premature') implies a loss of fertility at 30 years and falling fertility from the early twenties. Mathematical analyses of the age-related decline of the non-growing follicle (NGF) reserve (i.e. primordial follicles) in human ovaries predict that if at birth one ovary had 35 000 NGFs, menopause would occur at around 40 years of age but would be delayed to 60 years if the ovary began with 2.5 million NGFs (Wallace & Kelsey 2010, Kelsey *et al.* 2012). The number and types of molecules believed to maintain the balance between quiescence and activation of the primordial follicle reserve continue to be discovered chiefly from the study of transgenic mouse models (Reddy *et al.* 2010, Kim 2012, Monget *et al.* 2012, Pangas 2012, Adhikari *et al.* 2013). A key pathway implicated in this is the

Figure 5 Gene regulation of the primordial follicle reserve in the mouse ovary. Comparison of primordial follicle supply in postnatal day 10 mouse ovaries in WT, *p53*^{-/-}, and various BH3 member knockout models. Based on data from Kerr *et al.* (2012b).

PI3K pathway, which may have a crucial integrative role linking many of the factors associated with the balance between follicle growth suppression, activation, and the maintenance of healthy quiescence (Fig. 6). Molecules in this pathway include the tuberous sclerosis complex 1 (TSC1), which interacts with phosphatase and tensin homolog deleted on chromosome 10 (PTEN) to maintain quiescence, and the mammalian target of rapamycin (mTORC), which is an activator, and negatively regulated by TSC1 (Zheng *et al.* 2012). Both the oocyte and its pre-granulosa cells are the source of and probably the targets for these factors that physiologically exert both stimulatory and inhibitory actions upon the primordial follicle reserve. In addition to intracrine (factors produced and acting within a cell) and/or paracrine inhibition of the recruitment of primordial follicles, an additional 'brake' maintaining their quiescence and perhaps regulating the rate of recruitment may be applied by the growing follicle pool (Barnett *et al.* 2006, Moniruzzaman & Miyano 2010, Reddy *et al.* 2010, Monget *et al.* 2012). Mathematical modeling of histomorphometric data has shown age-dependent differential rates of NGF recruitment in the postnatal human ovary (Wallace & Kelsey 2010) with the great majority of follicles lost in the younger years. Implicit for these observations is the concept that in the early phases of postnatal life including and beyond puberty, some intra-ovarian mechanism limits the decline of the primordial reserve to conserve its stockpile of follicles. In the postnatal mouse ovary, it has been suggested that the preservation of a set range of follicle number in the primordial reserve is consistent with a 'quorum-sensing' model (Bristol-Gould *et al.* 2006b, Tingen *et al.* 2009). In

this model, the ovary can eliminate excess primordial follicles perhaps via a Bcl2 cell death mechanism but on current evidence cannot add primordial follicles to an otherwise abnormally insufficient reserve. While biochemical pathways that seem to be involved in the maintenance of primordial follicle health have been proposed based on knockout models (e.g. *Pdk1* and *Rps6* (Reddy *et al.* 2009)), how (or indeed whether) primordial follicle health is monitored physiologically is an important but unclear question.

What is the evidence for a 'brake' applied (at least temporarily) to the departure, by growth initiation or direct atresia, of primordial follicles from the reserve? In the BL/6 mouse strain, following the precipitous decline during the neonatal period, the depletion of primordial follicles per ovary is minimal, losing on an average of less than one follicle per day for up to 14 weeks (Kerr *et al.* 2006, Rodrigues *et al.* 2009) but thereafter declines significantly up to 300 days (Kerr *et al.* 2012a). Using cell lineage tracing, Lei & Spradling (2013) showed that the primordial follicle population is highly stable in the postnatal mouse ovary. With an estimated half-life of 10 months in adult life, the supply of primordial follicles established in the neonatal ovary is sufficient to sustain adult folliculogenesis (and fertility) without a source of renewal Lei & Spradling (2013). When growth-initiated, i.e. primary follicles are counted, these decline significantly, losing about 2.5 follicles on average/day (JB Kerr, L Brogan, M Myers, K J Hutt, T Mladenovska, S Ricardo, K Hamza, C L Scott, A Strasser & J K Findlay 2012, unpublished data). Could the growing primary follicles and their successors the secondary/antral follicles play a role in restraining recruitment from the primordial reserve? The preferential location of the reserve to the ovarian cortex with growing follicles mostly confined to the medulla (Da Silva-Buttkus *et al.* 2009) suggests a follicle-derived gradient of inhibitory and stimulatory signals that reflect this arrangement. Spatial analysis of primordial inhibition has led to the proposal that these follicles inhibit each other by producing as yet unidentified paracrine factors that prevent their activation into primary follicles (Da Silva-Buttkus *et al.* 2009). Perhaps growing follicles influence the rate of entry of primordial follicles into the growth phase, and the phenotype of the anti-Müllerian hormone (AMH) knockout mouse suggests that AMH may contribute to this (Durlinger *et al.* 1999). Analysis of AMH concentrations in relation to NGF number and recruitment across life indicate changing relationships during puberty and early adult life (Fleming *et al.* 2012) in keeping with this factor also playing a significant role in the human. The signal for activation of a reserve follicle may also be based on the origin of the pregranulosa cells and timing of follicle formation, with a separate medullary population formed immediately after birth distinct from the cortical population that supports adult fertility (Mork *et al.* 2012). This

Figure 6 Schematic diagram illustrating the options available for primordial follicles leaving the arrested reserve (growth/suppression of growth, maintenance of health, elimination, and possibly renewal) and representative proteins or genes identified as regulators of these various pathways.

interpretation, based on mouse experimental data, appears to differ from a recent reanalysis of bovine ovarian development (Hummitzsch *et al.* 2013), which indicates that all pregranulosa cells arise early from precursor cells first identifiable within the ovarian surface epithelium.

Thus, in the mouse, particularly during the early phase of reproductive life, oocytes destined for ovulation may in theory be supplied mainly from the diminishing primary follicle population. As time passes, this temporary stock of growing follicles can by itself no longer sustain the folliculogenic production line and the dwindling size of the early growing follicle population becomes insufficient to exert an inhibitory effect or restraint over the primordial reserve. At that point, some of the previously dormant primordial follicles are activated, and the reserve is mobilized. Accessing primordial follicles stored in the reserve will lead ultimately to its depletion whereupon folliculogenesis is curtailed and ovulation ceases. Such detailed information is not available from human studies, which can only be based on cross-sectional analysis of limited data sets. While an increase in the rate of follicle depletion with age is often cited and holds true when expressed as a proportion of remaining follicles, a recent mathematical analysis of the number of follicles leaving the non-growing pool shows that this increases through childhood, peaking at ~900 follicles/month at the age of 14 years (with an average follicle endowment), then falling to 600/month at the age of 25 years, and 200/month at the age of 35 years (Kelsey *et al.* 2012).

The primordial follicle reserve: is it renewable?

In 2004, Johnson *et al.* proposed that in the mouse ovary, the incidence of ongoing, age-related follicle elimination by atresia outstripped the contemporaneous supply available in the primordial follicle reserve. This imbalance was predictive of exhaustion of the reserve within a few weeks beyond puberty (Johnson *et al.* 2004), yet mice may remain fertile for up to 12 months (Gosden *et al.* 1983). To offset the proposed loss of primordial follicles, evidence was presented for the existence of ovarian germline stem cells (GSC) capable of proliferation and meiotic maturation into newly minted oocytes (Johnson *et al.* 2004). Candidate cells were identified in the ovarian surface epithelium leading to the opinion that GSC had been discovered in the mouse (Spradling 2004). Later, the notion that GSC arise from the surface epithelium was revised because the small number (6 ± 3) estimated to be present in the postnatal day 40 ovary was insufficient to generate new oocytes to offset normal follicle loss (Johnson *et al.* 2005). Other studies of the superficial ovarian cortex reported a mixed population of oocytes, primordial follicles, oogonial-type cells, and unidentified cells in mitosis (Kerr *et al.* 2006). In seeking an alternative source

of GSC external to the ovaries, an origin from bone marrow and blood was next proposed with GSC seeding the mouse ovary to replenish the natural decline in the primordial reserve oocytes (Johnson *et al.* 2005). This study also reported that in ovaries of mice exposed to the cytotoxins, doxorubicin (DXR) or histone deacetylase inhibitor trichostatin A (TSA) resulted within 24–36 h in respective ‘spontaneous regeneration’ of lost primordial follicles or doubling of their numbers by ‘*de novo* oocyte production’. Together, these results were said to reinforce the concept that oogenesis and folliculogenesis could occur in the adult ovary (Johnson *et al.* 2005). However, other studies of the effects of DXR or TSA on mouse ovaries have shown depletion of the primordial follicle reserve with no evidence for regeneration (Kujjo *et al.* 2011, Kerr *et al.* 2012a). The contrasting outcomes of gain or loss of primordial follicles reported in different studies add to the debate on the renewability of germ cells/oocytes in the postnatal ovary, and it remains the case that even if there is some physiological follicular renewal, it too is finite (the incontrovertible existence of the menopause), whether as a result of limiting supply of germ cells, required associated somatic cells or both. A parabiosis model (Eggen *et al.* 2006) did not provide supportive evidence for a bone marrow or blood-borne source for ovulated mouse oocytes, but the presence or absence in the ovaries, of marrow- or blood-derived GSC or new follicles was not investigated. When bone marrow obtained from transgenic mice expressing germline-specific green fluorescent protein (GFP) was transplanted into WT recipients, GFP-positive germ cells/oocytes were detected in recipient ovaries, albeit at a low frequency of $1.4 \pm 0.6\%$ of the total immature follicle pool, but none developed into ovulated oocytes (Lee *et al.* 2007).

Further studies of the identification and developmental potential of GSC or oogonial stem cells (OSC) in the mouse and human ovary are now available (Zou *et al.* 2009, Pacchiarotti *et al.* 2010, White *et al.* 2012, Zhang *et al.* 2012) but the interpretation of the results continues to generate controversy (Oatley & Hunt 2012, Woods *et al.* 2013). The human data thus far available (White *et al.* 2012) indicate the existence of a small number of cells within the ovary that can be extracted, proliferate *in vitro*, and after labeling and injection into isolated human ovarian cortex tissue formed primordial follicles containing labeled oocytes. In the mouse, injection of these cells into adult ovary resulted in the ovulation of fertilizable oocytes and livebirths (Zou *et al.* 2009, White *et al.* 2012). This work requires further corroboration, and while potentially of considerable scientific and medical interest, provides no evidence that these cells contribute to physiological ovarian function, including fertility.

If OSC conform to stem cell kinetics, they must proliferate by mitosis to preserve their ‘stemness’. Genomic analysis in mice of the number of preceding

mitotic divisions for antral follicle oocytes revealed how many germ cell divisions have occurred since the zygote stage, this being referred to as oocyte 'depth' (Reizel *et al.* 2012). This study found that oocyte depth increases with age; 13 divisions on an average in oocytes sampled at day 30 but 20 divisions in oocytes obtained at 350 days. Do these divisions occur only during embryonic development or throughout life?

The first possibility is consistent with the 'production line' hypothesis (Henderson & Edwards 1968), i.e. the order in which oocytes ovulate postnatally follows the order in which oogonia entered meiosis (and cannot re-enter mitosis) in the embryonic ovary. Meiotic entry is not an 'all-or-none' event but a gradual process occurring from e13.5 to e18.5 (Peters *et al.* 1962, Ghafari *et al.* 2007, 2009) and progressing in the ovary in a cranial–caudal direction (Bullejos & Koopman 2004). Many oogonia in the fetal mouse (and human) ovary continue mitosis while others enter meiotic prophase (Evans 1982, Fulton *et al.* 2005) and therefore oogonia with fewer or greater numbers of mitotic divisions would respectively transit early or later into meiosis. Medullary oocytes become early activated primordial follicles but cortex-resident oocytes are delayed in their assembly as primordial follicles (Fig. 3B). This pattern of germ cell distribution and subsequent dynamics is initiated in the mouse ovary at e13.5 (Byskov *et al.* 1997).

Woods *et al.* (2012) favor the alternative possibility whereby additional mitoses of OSC during postnatal life produce oocytes of greater 'depth' consistent with measured genetic signatures. Cells with OSC-type properties have been found among primordial follicles in or subjacent to the surface epithelium of the neonatal mouse ovary (Zou *et al.* 2009), and although cells with similar characteristics have been observed (Kerr *et al.* 2006), their identity, function, and fate remain to be confirmed. Bristol-Gould *et al.* (2006a) and Tingen *et al.* (2009) reported that 5% of germ cells in the neonatal mouse ovary are 'residual' oogonia, which did not enter meiosis between e13.5 and e18.5. If bypassing oocyte nest formation and encapsulation to form primordial follicles, do these orphan oogonia represent the OSC, being rare, unrecognized with routine histology (not being primordial follicles), and problematic to characterize using established stem cell or germline cell markers? Further investigations may reveal if these reputed OSC coexist with the conventional primordial follicle reserve and represent a hitherto unknown population of germ cells with the potential of development given special opportunity.

Conclusions

From the time of its formation and development within the fetal or neonatal ovary, and throughout the postnatal reproductive life span, the primordial follicle reserve is subject to constant change. The remarkable

increase then substantial loss of germ cells in the fetal ovary impacts the dynamics of the reserve to the extent of providing oocytes for assembly into primordial follicles. The maximum supply of primordial follicles is the net result of the addition to the reserve of suitably developed oocytes, counterbalanced by depletion through germ cell death, and, depending on species, activation of follicles into a growth phase. Mechanisms controlling germ cell proliferation are not fully understood, but evidence is emerging for regulation by interactions between a variety of transcription and growth factors. Elimination of germ cells is likely due to several processes particularly via apoptosis but with increasing evidence for non-apoptotic cell death, such as autophagy, acting alone or in combination with apoptosis and dependant on the type and biological status of the germ cells necessitating their removal. Although in postnatal life many primordial follicles in humans may be preserved for decades in a state of dormancy, the dynamic nature of the primordial follicle reserve is again evident, chiefly through depletion as follicles activate and enter folliculogenesis, and possibly by direct elimination/atresia of those follicles sustaining genomic impairment. Theoretically, manipulation of the rate of activation of the primordial follicle pool could be of clinical value. Temporary increased activation could be of value to women requiring assisted conception later in life to increase the number of oocytes that could be recovered, and conversely slowed activation could be of value to delay the menopause and possibly prolong natural fertility if a reduced pool (and hence increased risk of early menopause) was identified. These possibilities remain remote and, as with all manipulations of the germ line, raise very serious safety considerations. Recent reports of the existence of a rare population of GSC in mouse and human ovaries have led to suggestions that these cells may partially replenish the reserve as its primordial follicle supply is diminished. If further work confirms recent studies showing that isolated GSC can form follicles with fertilizable oocytes and viable embryos, this may usher in a new paradigm: an ancillary germ cell population coexisting with the primordial follicle pool, the 'reserve' of the reserve.

Declaration of interest

The authors declare that there is no conflict of interest that could be perceived as prejudicing the impartiality of the review reported.

Funding

The authors' work is supported by grants from the UK Medical Research Council (G1100357 to R A Anderson) and a T M Ramsay Fellowship and Ramaciotti Establishment Grant (to M Myers).

References

- Abir R, Orvieto R, Dicker D, Zukerman Z, Barnett M & Fisch B 2002 Preliminary studies on apoptosis in human fetal ovaries. *Fertility and Sterility* **78** 259–264. (doi:10.1016/S0015-0282(02)03218-1)
- Adhikari D, Risal S, Liu K & Shen Y 2013 Pharmacological inhibition of mTORC1 prevents over-activation of the primordial follicle pool in response to elevated PI3K signaling. *PLoS ONE* **8** e53810. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0053810)
- Albamonte MS, Willis MA, Albamonte MI, Jensen F, Espinosa MB & Vitullo AD 2008 The developing human ovary: immunohistochemical analysis of germ-cell-specific VASA protein, BCL-2/BAX expression balance and apoptosis. *Human Reproduction* **23** 1895–1901. (doi:10.1093/humrep/den197)
- Alton M & Taketo T 2007 Switch from BAX-dependent to BAX-independent germ cell loss during the development of fetal mouse ovaries. *Journal of Cell Science* **120** 417–424. (doi:10.1242/jcs.03332)
- Anderson RA, Cambray N, Hartley PS & McNeilly AS 2002 Expression and localization of inhibin α , inhibin/activin β A and β B and the activin type II and inhibin β -glycan receptors in the developing human testis. *Reproduction* **123** 779–788. (doi:10.1530/rep.0.1230779)
- Baker TGA 1963 Quantitative and cytological study of germ cells in human ovaries. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London. Series B. Biological Sciences* **158** 417–433. (doi:10.1098/rspb.1963.0055)
- Barnett KR, Schilling C, Greenfield CR, Tomic D & Flaws JA 2006 Ovarian follicle development and transgenic mouse models. *Human Reproduction Update* **12** 537–555. (doi:10.1093/humupd/dml022)
- Bayne RA, Martins da Silva SJ & Anderson RA 2004 Increased expression of the FIGLA transcription factor is associated with primordial follicle formation in the human fetal ovary. *Molecular Human Reproduction* **10** 373–381. (doi:10.1093/molehr/gah056)
- Bayne RA, Eddie SL, Collins CS, Childs AJ, Jabbour HN & Anderson RA 2009 Prostaglandin E₂ as a regulator of germ cells during ovarian development. *Journal of Clinical Endocrinology and Metabolism* **94** 4053–4060. (doi:10.1210/jc.2009-0755)
- Beaumont HM & Mandl AM 1963 A quantitative study of primordial germ cells in the male rat. *Journal of Embryology and Experimental Morphology* **11** 715–740.
- Bergeron JM, Gahr M, Horan K, Wibbels T & Crews D 1998 Cloning and *in situ* hybridization analysis of estrogen receptor in the developing gonad of the red-eared slider turtle, a species with temperature-dependent sex determination. *Development, Growth & Differentiation* **40** 243–254. (doi:10.1046/j.1440-169X.1998.00013.x)
- Block E 1951 Quantitative morphological investigations of the follicular system in women; methods of quantitative determinations. *Acta Anatomica* **12** 267–285. (doi:10.1159/000140549)
- Block E 1952 Quantitative morphological investigations of the follicular system in women; variations at different ages. *Acta Anatomica* **14** 108–123. (doi:10.1159/000140595)
- Block E 1953 A quantitative morphological investigation of the follicular system in newborn female infants. *Acta Anatomica* **17** 201–206. (doi:10.1159/000140805)
- Boumela I, Assou S, Aouacheria A, Haouzi D, Dechaud H, De Vos J, Handside A & Hamamah S 2011 Involvement of BCL2 family members in the regulation of human oocyte and early embryo survival and death: gene expression and beyond. *Reproduction* **141** 549–561. (doi:10.1530/REP-10-0504)
- Bristol-Gould SK, Kreeger PK, Selkirk CG, Kilen SM, Cook RW, Kipp JL, Shea LD, Mayo KE & Woodruff TK 2006a Postnatal regulation of germ cells by activin: the establishment of the initial follicle pool. *Developmental Biology* **298** 132–148. (doi:10.1016/j.ydbio.2006.06.025)
- Bristol-Gould SK, Kreeger PK, Selkirk CG, Kilen SM, Mayo KE, Shea LD & Woodruff TK 2006b Fate of the initial follicle pool: empirical and mathematical evidence supporting its sufficiency for adult fertility. *Developmental Biology* **298** 149–154. (doi:10.1016/j.ydbio.2006.06.023)
- Broekmans FJ, Soules MR & Fauser BC 2009 Ovarian aging: mechanisms and clinical consequences. *Endocrine Reviews* **30** 465–493. (doi:10.1210/er.2009-0006)
- Bullejos M & Koopman P 2004 Germ cells enter meiosis in a rostro-caudal wave during development of the mouse ovary. *Molecular Reproduction and Development* **68** 422–428. (doi:10.1002/mrd.20105)
- Byskov AG, Guoliang X & Andersen CY 1997 The cortex–medulla oocyte growth pattern is organized during fetal life: an *in-vitro* study of the mouse ovary. *Molecular Human Reproduction* **3** 795–800. (doi:10.1093/molehr/3.9.795)
- Childs AJ & Anderson RA 2009 Activin A selectively represses expression of the membrane-bound isoform of kit ligand in human fetal ovary. *Fertility and Sterility* **92** 1416–1419. (doi:10.1016/j.fertnstert.2009.03.095)
- Childs AJ, Bayne RA, Murray AA, Martins da Silva SJ, Collins CS, Spears N & Anderson RA 2010a Differential expression and regulation by activin of the neurotrophins BDNF and NT4 during human and mouse ovarian development. *Developmental Dynamics* **239** 1211–1219. (doi:10.1002/dvdy.22252)
- Childs AJ, Kinnell HL, Collins CS, Hogg K, Bayne RA, Green SJ, McNeilly AS & Anderson RA 2010b BMP signaling in the human fetal ovary is developmentally regulated and promotes primordial germ cell apoptosis. *Stem Cells* **28** 1368–1378. (doi:10.1002/stem.440)
- Christofferson DE & Yuan J 2010 Necroptosis as an alternative form of programmed cell death. *Current Opinion in Cell Biology* **22** 263–268. (doi:10.1016/j.jceb.2009.12.003)
- Coucovanis EC, Sherwood SW, Carswell-Crumpton C, Spack EG & Jones PP 1993 Evidence that the mechanism of prenatal germ cell death in the mouse is apoptosis. *Experimental Cell Research* **209** 238–247. (doi:10.1006/excr.1993.1307)
- Coutts SM, Childs AJ, Fulton N, Collins C, Bayne RA, McNeilly AS & Anderson RA 2008 Activin signals via SMAD2/3 between germ and somatic cells in the human fetal ovary and regulates kit ligand expression. *Developmental Biology* **314** 189–199. (doi:10.1016/j.ydbio.2007.11.026)
- Da Silva-Butkus P, Marcelli G, Franks S, Stark J & Hardy K 2009 Inferring biological mechanisms from spatial analysis: prediction of a local inhibitor in the ovary. *PNAS* **106** 456–461. (doi:10.1073/pnas.0810012106)
- De Felici M, Lobascio AM & Klinger FG 2008 Cell death in fetal oocytes: many players for multiple pathways. *Autophagy* **4** 240–242.
- De Pol A, Vaccina F, Forabosco A, Cavazzuti E & Marzona L 1997 Apoptosis of germ cells during human prenatal oogenesis. *Human Reproduction* **12** 2235–2241. (doi:10.1093/humrep/12.10.2235)
- Dong J, Albertini DF, Nishimori K, Kumar TR, Lu N & Matzuk MM 1996 Growth differentiation factor-9 is required during early ovarian folliculogenesis. *Nature* **383** 531–535. (doi:10.1038/383531a0)
- Durlinger AL, Kramer P, Karels B, de Jong FH, Uilenbroek JT, Grootegeed JA & Themmen AP 1999 Control of primordial follicle recruitment by anti-Müllerian hormone in the mouse ovary. *Endocrinology* **140** 5789–5796. (doi:10.1210/en.140.12.5789)
- Eggan K, Jurga S, Gosden R, Min IM & Wagers AJ 2006 Ovulated oocytes in adult mice derive from non-circulating germ cells. *Nature* **441** 1109–1114. (doi:10.1038/nature04929)
- Evans MA 1982 Effect of phenytoin on calcium disposition in pregnant and nonpregnant mice. *Toxicology and Applied Pharmacology* **63** 422–428. (doi:10.1016/0041-008X(82)90271-X)
- Flaws JA, Hirshfield AN, Hewitt JA, Babus JK & Furth PA 2001 Effect of bcl-2 on the primordial follicle endowment in the mouse ovary. *Biology of Reproduction* **64** 1153–1159. (doi:10.1095/biolreprod64.4.1153)
- Flaws JA, Marion SL, Miller KP, Christian PJ, Babus JK & Hoyer PB 2006 Effect of bcl-2 overexpression in mice on ovotoxicity caused by 4-vinylcyclohexene. *Toxicology and Applied Pharmacology* **215** 51–56. (doi:10.1016/j.taap.2006.03.003)
- Fleming R, Kelsey TW, Anderson RA, Wallace WH & Nelson SM 2012 Interpreting human follicular recruitment and anti-Müllerian hormone concentrations throughout life. *Fertility and Sterility* **98** 1097–1102. (doi:10.1016/j.fertnstert.2012.07.1114)
- Forabosco A & Sforza C 2007 Establishment of ovarian reserve: a quantitative morphometric study of the developing human ovary. *Fertility and Sterility* **88** 675–683. (doi:10.1016/j.fertnstert.2006.11.191)
- Fowler P, Flannigan S, Mathers A, Gillanders K, Lea RG, Wood MJ, Maheshwari A, Bhattacharya S, Collie-Duguid ES, Baker PJ *et al.* 2009 Gene expression analysis of human fetal ovarian primordial follicle formation. *Journal of Clinical Endocrinology and Metabolism* **94** 1427–1435. (doi:10.1210/jc.2008-2619)

- Fulton N, Martins da Silva SJ, Bayne RA & Anderson RA 2005 Germ cell proliferation and apoptosis in the developing human ovary. *Journal of Clinical Endocrinology and Metabolism* **90** 4664–4670. (doi:10.1210/jc.2005-0219)
- Gawriluk TR, Hale AN, Flaws JA, Dillon CP, Green DR & Rucker EB III 2011 Autophagy is a cell survival program for female germ cells in the murine ovary. *Reproduction* **141** 759–765. (doi:10.1530/REP-10-0489)
- Ghafari F, Gutierrez CG & Hartshorne GM 2007 Apoptosis in mouse fetal and neonatal oocytes during meiotic prophase one. *BMC Developmental Biology* **7** 87. (doi:10.1186/1471-213X-7-87)
- Ghafari F, Pelengaris S, Walters E & Hartshorne GM 2009 Influence of p53 and genetic background on prenatal oogenesis and oocyte attrition in mice. *Human Reproduction* **24** 1460–1472. (doi:10.1093/humrep/dep022)
- Gosden RG, Laing SC, Felicio LS, Nelson JF & Finch CE 1983 Imminent oocyte exhaustion and reduced follicular recruitment mark the transition to acyclicity in aging C57BL/6J mice. *Biology of Reproduction* **28** 255–260. (doi:10.1095/biolreprod28.2.255)
- Greenfield CR, Roby KF, Pepling ME, Babus JK, Terranova PF & Flaws JA 2007 Tumor necrosis factor (TNF) receptor type 2 is an important mediator of TNF α function in the mouse ovary. *Biology of Reproduction* **76** 224–231. (doi:10.1095/biolreprod.106.055509)
- Guillon-Munos A, van Bemmelen MX & Clarke PG 2006 Autophagy can be a killer even in apoptosis-competent cells. *Autophagy* **2** 140–142. (doi:10.4161/auto.2.2.2443)
- Gursoy E, Ergin K, Basaloglu H, Koca Y & Seyrek K 2008 Expression and localisation of Bcl-2 and Bax proteins in developing rat ovary. *Research in Veterinary Science* **84** 56–61. (doi:10.1016/j.rvsc.2007.04.006)
- Hartley PS, Bayne RA, Robinson LL, Fulton N & Anderson RA 2002 Developmental changes in expression of myeloid cell leukemia-1 in human germ cells during oogenesis and early folliculogenesis. *Journal of Clinical Endocrinology and Metabolism* **87** 3417–3427. (doi:10.1210/jc.87.7.3417)
- Hartshorne GM, Lyrakou S, Hamoda H, Oloto E & Ghafari F 2009 Oogenesis and cell death in human prenatal ovaries: what are the criteria for oocyte selection? *Molecular Human Reproduction* **15** 805–819. (doi:10.1093/molehr/gap055)
- Henderson SA & Edwards RG 1968 Chiasma frequency and maternal age in mammals. *Nature* **218** 22–28. (doi:10.1038/218022a0)
- Holmes RL & Mandl AM 1962 The effect of norethynodrel on the ovaries and pituitary gland of adult female rats. *Journal of Endocrinology* **24** 497–515. (doi:10.1677/joe.0.0240497)
- Hu W, Zheng T & Wang J 2011 Regulation of fertility by the p53 family members. *Genes & Cancer* **2** 420–430. (doi:10.1177/1947601911408892)
- Hummitzsch K, Irving-Rodgers HF, Hatzirodos N, Bonner W, Sabatier L, Reinhardt DP, Sado Y, Ninomiya Y, Wilhelm D & Rodgers RJ 2013 A new model of development of the mammalian ovary and follicles. *PLoS ONE* **8** e55578. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0055578)
- Huntriss J, Gosden R, Hinkins M, Oliver B, Miller D, Rutherford AJ & Picton HM 2002 Isolation, characterization and expression of the human Factor In the Germline α (FIGLA) gene in ovarian follicles and oocytes. *Molecular Human Reproduction* **8** 1087–1095. (doi:10.1093/molehr/8.12.1087)
- Jaaskelainen M, Nieminen A, Pokkylä RM, Kauppinen M, Liakka A, Heikinheimo M, Vaskivuo TE, Klefstrom J & Tapanainen JS 2010 Regulation of cell death in human fetal and adult ovaries – role of Bcl-2 and Bcl-X(L). *Molecular and Cellular Endocrinology* **330** 17–24. (doi:10.1016/j.mce.2010.07.020)
- Johnson J, Canning J, Kaneko T, Pru JK & Tilly JL 2004 Germline stem cells and follicular renewal in the postnatal mammalian ovary. *Nature* **428** 145–150. (doi:10.1038/nature02316)
- Johnson J, Bagley J, Skaznik-Wikiel M, Lee HJ, Adams GB, Niikura Y, Tschudy KS, Tilly JC, Cortes ML, Forkert R *et al.* 2005 Oocyte generation in adult mammalian ovaries by putative germ cells in bone marrow and peripheral blood. *Cell* **122** 303–315. (doi:10.1016/j.cell.2005.06.031)
- Kelsey TW, Anderson RA, Wright P, Nelson SM & Wallace WH 2012 Data-driven assessment of the human ovarian reserve. *Molecular Human Reproduction* **18** 79–87. (doi:10.1093/molehr/gar059)
- Kerr JB, Duckett R, Myers M, Britt KL, Mladenovska T & Findlay JK 2006 Quantification of healthy follicles in the neonatal and adult mouse ovary: evidence for maintenance of primordial follicle supply. *Reproduction* **132** 95–109. (doi:10.1530/rep.1.01128)
- Kerr JB, Brogan L, Myers M, Hutt KJ, Mladenovska T, Ricardo S, Hamza K, Scott CL, Strasser A & Findlay JK 2012a The primordial follicle reserve is not renewed after chemical or gamma-irradiation mediated depletion. *Reproduction* **143** 469–476. (doi:10.1530/REP-11-0430)
- Kerr JB, Hutt KJ, Michalak EM, Cook M, Vandenberg CJ, Liew SH, Bouillet P, Mills A, Scott CL, Findlay JK *et al.* 2012b DNA damage-induced primordial follicle oocyte apoptosis and loss of fertility require Tap63-mediated induction of Puma and Noxa. *Molecular Cell* **48** 343–352. (doi:10.1016/j.molcel.2012.08.017)
- Kezele P, Nilsson E & Skinner MK 2002 Cell–cell interactions in primordial follicle assembly and development. *Frontiers in Bioscience* **7** d1990–d1996. (doi:10.2741/kezele)
- Kim JY 2012 Control of ovarian primordial follicle activation. *Clinical and Experimental Reproductive Medicine* **39** 10–14. (doi:10.5653/term.2012.39.1.10)
- Kimura F, Bonomi LM & Schneyer AL 2011 Follistatin regulates germ cell nest breakdown and primordial follicle formation. *Endocrinology* **152** 697–706. (doi:10.1210/en.2010-0950)
- Kujjo LL, Chang EA, Pereira RJ, Dhar S, Marrero-Rosado B, Sengupta S, Wang H, Cibelli JB & Perez GI 2011 Chemotherapy-induced late transgenerational effects in mice. *PLoS ONE* **6** e17877. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0017877)
- Kurilo LF 1981 Oogonia degeneration in human pre- and perinatal oogenesis. *Tsitologiya i Genetika* **15** 78–82.
- Lee H-J, Selesniemi K, Niikura Y, Niikura T, Klein R, Dombkowski DM & Tilly JL 2007 Bone marrow transplantation generates immature oocytes and rescues long-term fertility in a preclinical mouse model of chemotherapy-induced premature ovarian failure. *Journal of Clinical Oncology* **25** 3198–3204. (doi:10.1200/JCO.2006.10.3028)
- Lei L & Spradling AC 2013 Female mice lack adult germ-line stem cells but sustain oogenesis using stable primordial follicles. *PNAS* **110** 8585–8590. (doi:10.1073/pnas.1306189110)
- Livera G, Petre-Lazar B, Guerin MJ, Trautmann E, Coffigny H & Habert R 2008 p63 null mutation protects mouse oocytes from radio-induced apoptosis. *Reproduction* **135** 3–12. (doi:10.1530/REP-07-0054)
- Lobascio AM, Klinger FG, Scaldaferrri ML, Farini D & De Felici M 2007 Analysis of programmed cell death in mouse fetal oocytes. *Reproduction* **134** 241–252. (doi:10.1530/REP-07-0141)
- Maheshwari A & Fowler PA 2008 Primordial follicular assembly in humans – revisited. *Zygote* **16** 285–296. (doi:10.1017/S0967199408004802)
- Mansen LS, Lutterodt MC, Andersen EW, Byskov AG & Andersen CY 2011 Germ cell numbers in human embryonic and fetal gonads during the first two trimesters of pregnancy: analysis of six published studies. *Human Reproduction* **26** 2140–2145. (doi:10.1093/humrep/der149)
- Marcinkiewicz JL, Balchak SK & Morrison LJ 2002 The involvement of tumor necrosis factor- α (TNF) as an intraovarian regulator of oocyte apoptosis in the neonatal rat. *Frontiers in Bioscience* **7** d1997–d2005. (doi:10.2741/marcin)
- Martins da Silva SJ, Bayne RA, Cambray N, Hartley PS, McNeilly AS & Anderson RA 2004 Expression of activin subunits and receptors in the developing human ovary: activin A promotes germ cell survival and proliferation before primordial follicle formation. *Developmental Biology* **266** 334–345. (doi:10.1016/j.ydbio.2003.10.030)
- McClellan KA, Gosden R & Taketo T 2003 Continuous loss of oocytes throughout meiotic prophase in the normal mouse ovary. *Developmental Biology* **258** 334–348. (doi:10.1016/S0012-1606(03)00132-5)
- Monget P, Bobe J, Gougeon A, Fabre S, Monniaux D & Dalbès-Tran R 2012 The ovarian reserve in mammals: a functional and evolutionary perspective. *Molecular and Cellular Endocrinology* **356** 2–12. (doi:10.1016/j.mce.2011.07.046)
- Moniruzzaman M & Miyano T 2010 Growth of primordial oocytes in neonatal and adult mammals. *Journal of Reproduction and Development* **56** 559–566. (doi:10.1262/jrd.10-071H)
- Mork L, Maatouk DM, McMahon JA, Guo JJ, Zhang P, McMahon AP & Capel B 2012 Temporal differences in granulosa cell specification in the ovary reflect distinct follicle fates in mice. *Biology of Reproduction* **86** 37. (doi:10.1095/biolreprod.111.095208)
- Myers M, Britt KL, Wreford NG, Ebling FJ & Kerr JB 2004 Methods for quantifying follicular numbers within the mouse ovary. *Reproduction* **127** 569–580. (doi:10.1530/rep.1.00095)

- Nelson SM, Telfer EE & Anderson RA 2013 The ageing ovary and uterus: new biological insights. *Human Reproduction Update* **19** 67–83. (doi:10.1093/humupd/dms043)
- Oatley J & Hunt PA 2012 Of mice and (wo)men: purified oogonial stem cells from mouse and human ovaries. *Biology of Reproduction* **86** 196. (doi:10.1095/biolreprod.112.100297)
- Pacchiarotti J, Maki C, Ramos T, Marh J, Howerton K, Wong J, Pham J, Anorve S, Chow YC & Izadyar F 2010 Differentiation potential of germ line stem cells derived from the postnatal mouse ovary. *Differentiation* **79** 159–170. (doi:10.1016/j.diff.2010.01.001)
- Pangas SA 2012 Regulation of the ovarian reserve by members of the transforming growth factor β family. *Molecular Reproduction and Development* **79** 666–679. (doi:10.1002/mrd.22076)
- Pangas SA, Choi Y, Ballow DJ, Zhao Y, Westphal H, Matzuk MM & Rajkovic A 2006 Oogenesis requires germ cell-specific transcriptional regulators Sohlh1 and Lhx8. *PNAS* **103** 8090–8095. (doi:10.1073/pnas.0601083103)
- Paredes A, Romero C, Dissen GA, DeChiara TM, Reichardt L, Cornea A, Ojeda SR & Xu B 2004 TrkB receptors are required for follicular growth and oocyte survival in the mammalian ovary. *Developmental Biology* **267** 430–449. (doi:10.1016/j.ydbio.2003.12.001)
- Pepling ME 2006 From primordial germ cell to primordial follicle: mammalian female germ cell development. *Genesis* **44** 622–632. (doi:10.1002/dvg.20258)
- Pepling ME & Spradling AC 2001 Mouse ovarian germ cell cysts undergo programmed breakdown to form primordial follicles. *Developmental Biology* **234** 339–351. (doi:10.1006/dbio.2001.0269)
- Pepling ME, Sundman EA, Patterson NL, Gephardt GW, Medico L Jr & Wilson KI 2010 Differences in oocyte development and estradiol sensitivity among mouse strains. *Reproduction* **139** 349–357. (doi:10.1530/REP-09-0392)
- Perez GI, Robles R, Knudson CM, Flaws JA, Korsmeyer SJ & Tilly JL 1999 Prolongation of ovarian lifespan into advanced chronological age by Bax-deficiency. *Nature Genetics* **21** 200–203. (doi:10.1038/5985)
- Pesce M, Klinger FG & De Felici M 2002 Derivation in culture of primordial germ cells from cells of the mouse epiblast: phenotypic induction and growth control by Bmp4 signalling. *Mechanisms of Development* **112** 15–24. (doi:10.1016/S0925-4773(01)00624-4)
- Peters H, Levy E & Crone M 1962 Deoxyribonucleic acid synthesis in oocytes of mouse embryos. *Nature* **195** 915–916. (doi:10.1038/195915a0)
- Peters H, Byskov AG & Grinstead J 1978 Follicular growth in fetal and prepubertal ovaries of humans and other primates. *Clinics in Endocrinology and Metabolism* **7** 469–485. (doi:10.1016/S0300-595X(78)80005-X)
- Poljicanin A, Vukusic Pusic T, Vukojevic K, Caric A, Vilovic K, Tomic S, Soljic V & Saraga-Babic M 2013 The expression patterns of pro-apoptotic and anti-apoptotic factors in human fetal and adult ovary. *Acta Histochemica* **115** 533–540. (doi:10.1016/j.acthis.2012.11.009)
- Rajkovic A, Pangas SA, Ballow D, Suzumori N & Matzuk MM 2004 NOBOX deficiency disrupts early folliculogenesis and oocyte-specific gene expression. *Science* **305** 1157–1159. (doi:10.1126/science.1099755)
- Reddy P, Adhikari D, Zheng W, Liang S, Hamalainen T, Tohonen V, Ogawa W, Noda T, Volarevic S, Huhtaniemi I *et al.* 2009 PDK1 signaling in oocytes controls reproductive aging and lifespan by manipulating the survival of primordial follicles. *Human Molecular Genetics* **18** 2813–2824. (doi:10.1093/hmg/ddp217)
- Reddy P, Zheng W & Liu K 2010 Mechanisms maintaining the dormancy and survival of mammalian primordial follicles. *Trends in Endocrinology and Metabolism* **21** 96–103. (doi:10.1016/j.tem.2009.10.001)
- Reizel Y, Itzkovitz S, Adar R, Elbaz J, Jinich A, Chapal-Ilani N, Maruvka YE, Nevo N, Marx Z, Horovitz I *et al.* 2012 Cell lineage analysis of the mammalian female germline. *PLoS Genetics* **8** e1002477. (doi:10.1371/journal.pgen.1002477)
- Rodrigues P, Limback D, McGinnis LK, Plancha CE & Albertini DF 2009 Multiple mechanisms of germ cell loss in the perinatal mouse ovary. *Reproduction* **137** 709–720. (doi:10.1530/REP-08-0203)
- Rubinstein AD & Kimchi A 2012 Life in the balance – a mechanistic view of the crosstalk between autophagy and apoptosis. *Journal of Cell Science* **125** 5259–5268. (doi:10.1242/jcs.115865)
- Rucker EB III, Dierisseau P, Wagner KU, Garrett L, Wynshaw-Boris A, Flaws JA & Hennighausen L 2000 Bcl-x and Bax regulate mouse primordial germ cell survival and apoptosis during embryogenesis. *Molecular Endocrinology* **14** 1038–1052. (doi:10.1210/me.14.7.1038)
- Spears N, Molinek MD, Robinson LL, Fulton N, Cameron H, Shimoda K, Telfer EE, Anderson RA & Price DJ 2003 The role of neurotrophin receptors in female germ-cell survival in mouse and human. *Development* **130** 5481–5491. (doi:10.1242/dev.00707)
- Spradling AC 2004 Stem cells: more like a man. *Nature* **428** 133–134. (doi:10.1038/428133b)
- Stoop H, Honecker F, Cools M, de Krijger R, Bokemeyer C & Looijenga LH 2005 Differentiation and development of human female germ cells during prenatal gonadogenesis: an immunohistochemical study. *Human Reproduction* **20** 1466–1476. (doi:10.1093/humrep/deh800)
- Suh EK, Yang A, Kettenbach A, Bamberger C, Michaelis AH, Zhu Z, Elvin JA, Bronson RT, Crum CP & McKeon F 2006 p63 protects the female germ line during meiotic arrest. *Nature* **444** 624–628. (doi:10.1038/nature05337)
- Tingen C, Kim A & Woodruff TK 2009 The primordial pool of follicles and nest breakdown in mammalian ovaries. *Molecular Human Reproduction* **15** 795–803. (doi:10.1093/molehr/gap073)
- Vandenabeele P, Galluzzi L, Vanden Berghe T & Kroemer G 2010 Molecular mechanisms of necroptosis: an ordered cellular explosion. *Nature Reviews. Molecular Cell Biology* **11** 700–714. (doi:10.1038/nrm2970)
- Vaskivuo TE, Anttonen M, Herva R, Billig H, Dorland M, te Velde ER, Stenback F, Heikinheimo M & Tapanainen JS 2001 Survival of human ovarian follicles from fetal to adult life: apoptosis, apoptosis-related proteins, and transcription factor GATA-4. *Journal of Clinical Endocrinology and Metabolism* **86** 3421–3429. (doi:10.1210/jc.86.7.3421)
- Wallace WH & Kelsey TW 2010 Human ovarian reserve from conception to the menopause. *PLoS ONE* **5** e8772. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0008772)
- Wartenberg H, Ihmer A, Schwarz S, Miething A & Viebahn C 2001 Mitotic arrest of female germ cells during prenatal oogenesis. A colcemid-like, non-apoptotic cell death. *Anatomy and Embryology* **204** 421–435. (doi:10.1007/s00429-001-0216-7)
- Wen J, Zhang H, Li G, Mao G, Chen X, Wang J, Guo M, Mu X, Ouyang H, Zhang M *et al.* 2009 PAR6, a potential marker for the germ cells selected to form primordial follicles in mouse ovary. *PLoS ONE* **4** e7372. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0007372)
- White YA, Woods DC, Takai Y, Ishihara O, Seki H & Tilly JL 2012 Oocyte formation by mitotically active germ cells purified from ovaries of reproductive-age women. *Nature Medicine* **18** 413–421. (doi:10.1038/nm.2669)
- Woods DC, Telfer EE & Tilly JL 2012 Oocyte family trees: old branches or new stems? *PLoS Genetics* **8** e1002848. (doi:10.1371/journal.pgen.1002848)
- Woods DC, White YA & Tilly JL 2013 Purification of oogonial stem cells from adult mouse and human ovaries: an assessment of the literature and a view toward the future. *Reproductive Sciences* **20** 7–15. (doi:10.1177/1933719112462632)
- Xu B, Hua J, Zhang Y, Jiang X, Zhang H, Ma T, Zheng W, Sun R, Shen W, Sha J *et al.* 2011 Proliferating cell nuclear antigen (PCNA) regulates primordial follicle assembly by promoting apoptosis of oocytes in fetal and neonatal mouse ovaries. *PLoS ONE* **6** e16046. (doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0016046)
- Zhang YS, Lu ZY, Yu Y, Li XR, Li WB, Wang YN & Geng Y 2012 Derivation, culture and retinal pigment epithelial differentiation of human embryonic stem cells using human fibroblast feeder cells. *Journal of Assisted Reproduction and Genetics* **29** 735–744. (doi:10.1007/s10815-012-9802-2)
- Zheng W, Nagaraju G, Liu Z & Liu K 2012 Functional roles of the phosphatidylinositol 3-kinases (PI3Ks) signaling in the mammalian ovary. *Molecular and Cellular Endocrinology* **356** 24–30. (doi:10.1016/j.mce.2011.05.027)
- Zou K, Yuan Z, Yang Z, Luo H, Sun K, Zhou L, Xiang J, Shi L, Yu Q, Zhang Y *et al.* 2009 Production of offspring from a germline stem cell line derived from neonatal ovaries. *Nature Cell Biology* **11** 631–636. (doi:10.1038/ncb1869)

Received 30 April 2013

First decision 14 June 2013

Revised manuscript received 17 July 2013

Accepted 8 August 2013